#### 1. S. OT 1297-1306:

What suffering, terrible for humans to see, most terrible of all that I have ever encountered! What madness came upon you, wretched one? What divine being was it that leapt further than the longest leap on top of your unhappy fate? Alas, poor man: I cannot even look at you, though there is much I want to ask, much to hear, and much to look at; such is the shiver  $(phrik\bar{e})$  you cause in me.

- **2.** *phrikē*: Hippocratic corpus: x 60 *phrikē*, x 36 *phrissō* (cf. x 1 *phrikazō*), x 51 *phrikōdēs* (and x 1 *phrikaleos*). Galen: x 110 *phrikē*, x 49 *phrissō*, x 86 *phrikōdēs*. Galen distinguishes between *phrikē* as affecting only the skin and *rhigos* (chill) as an experience of the whole body (*De tremore* vii. 612. 9-12 Kühn), though he notes that 'all other medical writers' use the terms interchangeably (*De tremore* vii. 611. 18-612. 4); for Hp. *Morb*. 1. 24 the distinction is simply of degree. NB esp. *phrikē*'s association with fever and cold sweats (e.g. Hp. *Aph*. 7. 4, *Morb*. 1. 23-5). In [Arist.] *Probl.*, see esp. Book 8 (887b10-889b9) on chill (*rhigos*) and shivering (*phrikē* x 9 root; a further x 25 elsewhere). Cf. e.g. Hes. *Op*. 539-40 (human piloerection a result of cold weather); Plut. *De primo frigido* 947C (*phrikē* and *tromos* names for the 'battle' between hot and cold).
- **3. Piloerection**: e.g. [Arist.] *Physiog*. 812b30, *Probl*. 888a38, 889a26, [Alex. Aphr.] *Probl*. 2. 26; cf. [Theocr.] *Id*. 25. 244, Plut. fr. 73 Sandbach.
- **4. In non-human animals**: e.g. S. fr. 875 Radt, [Arist.] *Physiog*. 812b30, Nic. *Ther*. 721, 727, Plut. *Arist*. 18. 2 (developing the Homeric image by which weapons etc. bristle like the fur of an angry animal), Dio Chrys. *Or*. 58. 4, Ach. Tat. 1. 12. 3, x 14 in Ael. *Nat*. An., [Alex. Aphr.] *Probl*. 4. 159.
- **5. Shuddering/shivering as symptom of fear**: Darwin (1889/1998) 70-1, 346-7 (trembling), 100-1, 104-5, 291-2, 295-8 (piloerection); 291, 346-7 (temp. changes), with Ekman's comments and further reading where relevant; cf. Eibl-Eibesfeldt (1989) 371 on piloerection, 479 on changes in skin temperature; Balcombe (2010) 48 (changes in body and skin temperature as symptoms of fear etc. in humans and animals). For low body temperature as a metonym for fear in various cultures, see Kövecses (2000) 5, 23-4. On the relation between actual physical temperature and the metaphorical concepts of emotional warmth and coldness, see Williams and Bargh (2008), Zhong and Leonardelli (2008).
- 6. Symptom as metonymy (i.e. name for emotion as such): see esp. E. Hipp. 415-18:

αϊ πῶς ποτ', ὧ δέσποινα ποντία Κύποι, βλέπουσιν ἐς πρόσωπα τῶν ξυνευνετῶν οὐδὲ σκότον φρίσσουσι τὸν ξυνεργάτην τέραμνά τ' οἴκων μή ποτε φθογγὴν ἀφῆι;

How, oh Cyprian, mistress of the deep, can they look their husbands in the face and not shudder at the darkness, their partner in crime, or at the timbers of the house, lest they at some stage speak?

On this phenomenon, cf. in general Ap. Dysc. *De constr.* 413. 5-415. 2. On metonymy and the extension of categories, see Lakoff (1987).

**7.** *Phrikē* and immediate auditory/visual stimuli: [Arist.] *Probl.* 886b9-11 (startle reflex, explicitly related to fear, 887a 1-3), 964b34-7; cf. startle reflex, shuddering, and fear at 964b22-9. Cf. *phrissō* etc.

+ ptc. of vb. of seeing, e.g. A. Supp. 346, [A.] PV 695. Cf. phrikōdēs of sights and sounds: E. Hipp. 1201-2, 1215-16, Andr. 1147-8, Ar. Ran. 1335-6, etc.

See esp. Plut. Crass. 23. 8-9:

But when they were near the Romans and the signal was raised by their commander, first of all they filled the plain with the sound of a deep and *phrikōdēs* roar (φθογγῆς βαρείας καὶ βρόμου φρικώδους). For the Parthians do not incite themselves to battle with horns or trumpets, but they have hollow drums of distended hide, covered with bronze bells, and on these they beat all at once in many quarters, and the instruments give forth a low and dismal tone, a blend of wild beast's roar and harsh thunder peal (τὰ δὲ φθέγεται βύθιόν τι καὶ δεινόν, ὡρυγῆ θηριώδει καὶ τραχύτητι βροντῆς μεμειγμένον). They had rightly judged that, of all the senses, hearing is the one most apt to confound the soul, soonest rouses its emotions, and most effectively unseats the judgment (εὖ πως συνεωρακότες ὅτι τῶν αἰσθητηρίων ἡ ἀκοὴ ταρακτικώτατόν ἐστι τῆς ψυχῆς καὶ τὰ περὶ ταύτην πάθη τάχιστα κινεῖ καὶ μάλιστα πάντων ἑξίστησι τὴν διάνοιαν).

8. Phrikē and the divine: see Burkert (2010). See (a short selection): (quasi-)epiphany: Xen. Cyr. 4. 2. 15: λέγεται φως τω Κύρω καὶ τω στρατεύματι έκ του οὐρανου προφανές γενέσθαι, ώστε πάσι μὲν φρίχην ἐγγίγνεσθαι πρὸς τὸ θεῖον, θάρρος δὲ πρὸς τοὺς πολεμίους (it is said that a light from heaven shone forth upon Cyrus and his army, so that they were all filled with  $phrik\bar{e}$  at the omen but with courage to meet the enemy); Plut. Arat. 32. 2: αὐτοῖς τε τοῖς πολίταις θέαμα σεμνότερον ἢ κατ' ἄνθρωπον ἐφάνη, καὶ τοῖς πολεμίοις φάσμα θεῖον ὁρᾶν δοκοῦσι φρίκην ἐνέβαλε καὶ  $\theta \acute{\alpha} \mu \beta o \varsigma$  ([a captive woman] seemed to the citizens themselves a vision of more than human majesty, while the enemy thought they saw an apparition from heaven and were struck with phrike and amazement, thambos); omens/dreams: Joseph. BJ 3. 353, Plut. De superst. 165F; cf. Il. 12. 208-9 (with rhigein); fear of divine wrath etc.: A. Th. 720-1, E. Cycl. 320, Pl. Resp. 387c; awe (sebas): Julian, Ad Heracl. 8. 14-17: οὕτω δή τι τοὺς θεοὺς πέφοικα καὶ φιλώ καὶ σέβω καὶ ἄζομαι καὶ πάνθ' άπλῶς τὰ τοιαῦτα πρὸς αὐτοὺς πάσχω, ὅσαπερ ἄν τις καὶ οἶα πρὸς ἀγαθοὺς δεσπότας, ποὸς διδασχάλους, ποὸς πατέρας, ποὸς κηδεμόνας (thus I shudder at the gods – I love, respect, and revere them, and in short have with regard to them the sort of feelings one would have towards good masters, teachers, fathers, or guardians); response to sacred places (etc.): D. 23. 74, Joseph. BJ 4. 181-2, 6. 123; oath: Phil. Jud. De decal. 141. 3, Joseph. Vit. 275, BJ 2. 139; cf. Il. 3. 259 (with οιγεῖν), A. R. 2. 291-2 (ditto); **mysteries**: esp. Plut. fr. 178 Sandbach: πλάναι τὰ πρῶτα καὶ περιδρομαὶ κοπώδεις καὶ διὰ σκότους τινὲς ὕποπτοι πορεῖαι καὶ ἀτέλεστοι, εἶτα πρὸ τοῦ τέλους αὐτοῦ τὰ δεινὰ πάντα, φρίκη καὶ τρόμος καὶ ίδρὼς καὶ θάμβος: ἐκ δὲ τούτου φῶς τι θαυμάσιον ἀπήντησεν καὶ τόποι καθαροὶ καὶ λειμῶνες ἐδέξαντο, φωνὰς καὶ χορείας καὶ σεμνότητας άκουσμάτων ίερων καὶ φασμάτων άγίων έχοντες ... (At first there are wanderings, wearisome running around, and inconclusive, fearful journeys; then, before the consummation itself, all the terrors – phrikē, trembling, sweating, and amazement (thambos). But after that one encounters a kind of miraculous light, and is welcomed by pure, open places and meadows, with voices and dancing and the awe-inspiring majesty ( $semnot\bar{e}s$ ) of sacred sounds and holy visions ...).

## 9. Arist. Po. 14, 1453b1-7:

ἔστιν μὲν οὖν τὸ φοβερὸν καὶ ἐλεεινὸν ἐκ τῆς ὄψεως γίγνεσθαι, ἔστιν δὲ καὶ ἐξ αὐτῆς τῆς συστάσεως τῶν πραγμάτων, ὅπερ ἐστὶ πρότερον καὶ ποιητοῦ ἀμείνονος. δεῖ γὰρ καὶ ἄνευ τοῦ ὀρᾶν οὕτω συνεστάναι τὸν μῦθον ὤστε τὸν ἀκούοντα τὰ πράγματα γινόμενα καὶ φρίττειν καὶ ἐλεεῖν ἐκ τῶν συμβαινόντων· ἄπερ ἂν πάθοι τις ἀκούων τὸν τοῦ Οἰδίπου μῦθον.

Pity and fear can derive from the visual (*opsis*), but also from the arrangement of the incidents itself, which is preferable and the mark of a better poet. For the plot ought to be so composed that, even without seeing a performance, one who merely hears what happens will shudder (*phrittein*) and feel pity as a result of the events – as indeed one would on hearing the plot of the *Oedipus*.

# 10. Gorg. Hel. 9:

τὴν ποίησιν ἄπασαν καὶ νομίζω καὶ ὀνομάζω λόγον ἔχοντα μέτρον· ἦς τοὺς ἀκούοντας εἰσῆλθε καὶ φρίκη περίφοβος καὶ ἔλεος πολύδακους καὶ πόθος φιλοπενθής, ἐπ' ἀλλοτρίων τε πραγμάτων καὶ σωμάτων εὐτυχίαις καὶ δυσπραγίαις ἴδιόν τι πάθημα διὰ τῶν λόγων ἔπαθεν ἡ ψυχή.

All poetry I regard and describe as speech with metre. Into those who listen to it comes a fearful shuddering  $(phrik\bar{e})$  and a tearful pity and a longing that loves to lament, and at the success and failure of others' affairs and persons the soul undergoes, through words, a certain experience of its own.

Context: persuasive speech is irresistible (8-14); but so is *opsis* (15-19); as the speech of astronomers persuades by making 'what is incredible and obscure apparent to the eyes of opinion' (*Helen* 13), so *opsis* 'engraves images of the objects of vision on the mind' (*Helen* 17).

## **11.** *Il*. 2. 484-7:

έσπετε νῦν μοι, Μοῦσαι, Ὀλύμπια δώματ' ἔχουσαι· ὑμεῖς γὰο θεαί ἐστε πάρεστέ τε ἴστέ τε πάντα, ἡμεῖς δὲ κλέος οἶον ἀκούομεν οὐδέ τι ἴδμεν· οἴ τινες ἡγεμόνες Δαναῶν καὶ κοίρανοι ἦσαν.

485

Tell me now, Muses, who have your homes on Olympus – for you are goddesses: you are present and know all things, while we hear only *kleos* and know nothing – who the leaders and princes of the Danaans were.

## Od. 8. 487-91:

"Δημόδοκ', ἔξοχα δή σε βοοτῶν αἰνίζομ' ἀπάντων- ἢ σέ γε Μοῦσ' ἐδίδαξε, Διὸς πάϊς, ἢ σέ γ' Ἀπόλλων- λίην γὰο κατὰ κόσμον Ἀχαιῶν οἶτον ἀείδεις, ὅσσ' ἔρξαν τ' ἔπαθόν τε καὶ ὅσσ' ἐμόγησαν Αχαιοί, ὡς τέ που ἢ αὐτὸς παρεὼν ἢ ἄλλου ἀκούσας."

490

'Demodocus, I praise you above all men; either the Muse, daughter of Zeus, taught you, or Apollo; for you sing of the fate of the Achaeans only too well, all that they did and suffered, and all the Achaeans' toils, almost as if you had been present yourself or heard from another who was.'

# 12. Pl. Ion 535c:

ἐγὼ γὰς ὅταν ἐλεινόν τι λέγω, δακςύων ἐμπίμπλανταί μου οἱ ὀφθαλμοί· ὅταν τε φοβεςὸν ἢ δεινόν, ὀςθαὶ αἱ τςίχες ἵστανται ὑπὸ φόβου καὶ ἡ καςδία πηδᾳ.

For whenever I tell of a pitiable event, my eyes fill with tears; and whenever I narrate something frightening or terrible, my hair stands on end out of fear, and my heart leaps.

# 535d-e:

Σω. οἶσθα οὖν ὅτι καὶ τῶν θεατῶν τοὺς πολλοὺς ταὐτὰ ταῦτα ὑμεῖς ἐργάζεσθε; Ιων. καὶ μάλα καλῶς οἶδα· καθορῶ γὰρ ἑκάστοτε αὐτοὺς ἄνωθεν ἀπὸ τοῦ βήματος κλάοντάς τε καὶ δεινὸν ἐμβλέποντας καὶ συνθαμβοῦντας τοῖς λεγομένοις.

Soc. So do you realize that you rhapsodes produce these same effects on most of the spectators too?

Ion. Yes, I am very well aware of that: every time it happens I look down on them from the platform above and see them weeping, with fear in their eyes, sharing my amazement (*thambos*) at what's said.

For empathy as 'feeling with' and sympathy as 'feeling for', see Oatley 2011, 115-20; on empathy versus sympathy, cf. various authors in Coplan and Goldie 2011.

### 13. Josephus, Jewish Wars 201-14:

There was a certain woman that dwelt beyond Jordan, her name was Mary ... She was eminent for her family and her wealth, and had fled away to Jerusalem with the rest of the multitude, and was with them besieged therein at this time. The other effects of this woman had been already seized upon ... and removed to the city. What she had treasured up besides, as also what food she had contrived to save, had been also carried off by the rapacious guards, who

came every day running into her house for that purpose. This put the poor woman into a very great passion, and by the frequent reproaches and imprecations she east at these rapacious villains, she had provoked them to anger against her; but none of them, either out of the indignation she had raised against herself, or out of commiseration of her case, would take away her life; and if she found any food, she perceived her labors were for others, and not for herself; and it was now become impossible for her any way to find any more food, while the famine pierced through her very bowels and marrow, when also her passion was fired to a degree beyond the famine itself; nor did she consult with any thing but with her passion and the necessity she was in. She then attempted a most unnatural thing; and snatching up her son, who was a child sucking at her breast, she said, 'O thou miserable infant! For whom shall I preserve thee in this war, this famine, and this sedition? As to the war with the Romans, if they preserve our lives, we must be slaves. This famine also will destroy us, even before that slavery comes upon us. Yet are these seditious rogues more terrible than both the other. Come on; be thou my food, and be thou a fury to these seditious varlets, and a by-word to the world, which is all that is now wanting to complete the calamities of us Jews.' As soon as she had said this, she slew her son, and then roasted him, and ate the one half of him, and kept the other half by her concealed. Upon this the seditious came in presently, and smelling the horrid scent of this food, they threatened her that they would cut her throat immediately if she did not show them what food she had gotten ready. She replied that she had saved a very fine portion of it for them, and withal uncovered what was left of her son. Hereupon they were seized with a horror and amazement of mind, and stood astonished at the sight  $(\tau \circ \dot{v} \circ \delta)$   $\dot{v} \circ \dot{v} \circ$ παρέκστασις [a hapax, found in one MS and printed by Niese; all other MSS have φρενών ἕκστασις] ἥοει καὶ παρὰ τὴν ὄψιν ἐπεπήγεσαν, 210), when she said to them, 'This is mine own son, and what hath been done was mine own doing! Come, eat of this food; for I have eaten of it myself! Do not you pretend to be either more tender than a woman, or more compassionate than a mother; but if you be so scrupulous, and do abominate this my sacrifice, as I have eaten the one half, let the rest be reserved for me also.' After which those men went out trembling, being never so much afrighted at any thing as they were at this, and with some difficulty they left the rest of that meat to the mother. Upon which the whole city was full of this horrid action immediately; and while every body laid this miserable case before their own eyes, they trembled, as if this unheard of action had been done by themselves (καὶ ποὸ όμμάτων ἕκαστος τὸ πάθος λαμβάνων ὥσπες αὐτῷ τολμηθὲν ἔφοιττε, 213). So those that were thus distressed by the famine were very desirous to die, and those already dead were esteemed happy, because they had not lived long enough either to hear or to see such miseries. This sad instance was quickly told to the Romans, some of whom could not believe it, and others pitied the distress which the Jews were under; but there were many of them who were hereby induced to a more bitter hatred than ordinary against our nation.

**14. Pity, fear, and shared vulnerability**: (pity) Arist. *Rhet*. 2. 8, 1385b13-33, 1386a25-9; (fear) *Po*. 13, 1453a4-6; cf. *Rhet*. 1386b27-9.

125

[What you say is true,] but nonetheless I pity him in his misfortune, even though he is my enemy, because he is yoked to dire ruin. In this I look out for my own situation no less than his, for I see that all of us who are alive are nothing more than apparitions or fleeting shadow.

In *OT* see 1194, 1211, 1216-21, 1286, 1296, 1299, 1303, 1347 (pity); 1217-18, 1297-9, 1303-6, 1348 (revulsion, but all associated in context with pity); cf. Creon at 1424-31. Cf. *Phil*. 501-6, *OC* 566-8; E. *Hec*. 282-7. Beyond tragedy see (e.g.) Bacchyl. 5. 155-62 (esp. 160-2 and cf. 89-92); Hdt. 1. 86. 6, 7. 46. 2.

# **15.** *Phrikē* and sympathy: see S. *Trach*. 1044-5: κλύουσ' ἔφοιξα τάσδε συμφοράς, φίλαι, ἄναχτος, οἴαις οἶος ὢν ἐλαύνεται.

I shudder when I hear our king suffering like this, friends; what terrible afflictions for a man like him.

# [A.] PV 687-95:

ἔα ἔα, ἄπεχε, φεῦ·
οὕποθ' <ιδό'> οὕποτ' ηὕχουν ξένους
μολεῖσθαι λόγους ἐς ἀκοὰν ἐμάν,
οὐδ' ιδε δυσθέατα καὶ δύσοιστα
†πήματα λύματα δείματ'
ἀμφήκει κέντοω ψύχειν ψυχὰν ἐμάν†.
ἰὼ [ὶὼ] μοῖρα μοῖρα,
πέφρικ' εἰσιδοῦσα πρᾶξιν Ἰοῦς.
695

Ah, keep away, oh! I never, ever thought that words so strange would come to my hearing, or that †sufferings, outrages, terrors† so hard to look at and to bear †would chill my soul with double-pronged goad† [vel sim.]. Ah, fate, fate, I shudder as I behold Io's plight.

#### 16. Plutarch, Aemilius Paullus 34. 7-35.3:

The whole army also carried laurel, following the chariot of their general by companies and divisions, and singing, partly certain traditional songs with a comic element, and partly victory paeans and encomia addressed to Aemilius, the object of everyone's attention and admiration, begrudged by no one that was good – unless it is true that some divine force has been allotted the task of detracting from exceedingly great good fortune and of making a mixture of human existence, in order that no one's life should be unsullied or without admixture of trouble, but that, as Homer says, those may be regarded as best off whose fortunes shift in the balance, now this way, now that.

Aemilius had four sons, two, Scipio and Fabius, who had been given in adoption to other families, as noted above, and two who were still boys, the children of a second wife, whom he had in his own house. Of these, one died at the age of fourteen, five days before Aemilius celebrated his triumph, and the other, twelve years old, died three days after the triumph. As a result, there was no Roman unaffected by his suffering; rather, they all shuddered (phrissein) at the cruelty of Tyche (ιστε μηδένα γενέσθαι Ῥωμαίων τοῦ πάθους ἀνάλγητον, ἀλλὰ φρίξαι τὴν ὡμότητα τῆς Τύχης ἄπαντας), as she felt no compunction at bringing such great grief into a house that was full of admiration, joy and sacrifices, or at mixing up laments and tears with paeans of victory and triumphs.

Vulnerability unites victors and vanquished: Aemilius' defeated opponent, Perseus, is as much a paradigm of the mutability of fortune as is Aemilius himself (26. 4-12, 27. 4-5, 33. 6-8, 37. 2). Cf. 29. 5: booty from the sack of the cities of Epirus produces no more than eleven drachmas per solider, so that 'everyone shuddered at the outcome of the war, that the division of an entire nation's wealth should yield so little profit and gain for each individual' (φρίξαι δὲ πάντας ἀνθρώπους τὸ τοῦ πολέμου τέλος, εἰς μικρὸν οὕτω τὸ καθ' ἕκαστον λῆμμα καὶ κέρδος ἔθνους ὅλου κατακερματισθέντος).

# References and further reading:

- Balcombe, J. (2010), Second Nature: The Inner Lives of Animals (New York).
- Burkert, W. (2010), 'Horror Stories: Zur Begegnung von Biologie, Philologie und Religion' in A. Bierl and W. Baumgart (eds), *Gewalt und Opfer: Im Dialog mit Walter Burkert* (Berlin) 45-56.
- Cairns, D. L. (2013), 'A Short History of Shudders' in A. Chaniotis and P. Ducrey (eds), Unveiling Emotions II: Emotions in Greece and Rome: Texts, Images, Material Culture (Stuttgart) 85-107
- Coplan, A. and Goldie, P. (eds) (2011), *Empathy: Philosophical and Psychological Perspectives* (Oxford).
- Darwin, C. (1889/1998), *The Expression of the Emotions in Man and Animals* (3<sup>rd</sup> edn., ed. P. Ekman, Oxford).
- Eibl-Eibesfeldt, I. (1989), Human Ethology (New York).
- Gibbs, R. W. (ed.) (2008), The Cambridge Handbook of Metaphor and Thought (Cambridge).
- Halliwell, F. S. (2002), The Aesthetics of Mimesis: Ancient Texts and Modern Problems (Princeton).
- (2011), Between Ecstasy and Truth: Interpretations of Greek Poetics from Homer to Longinus (Oxford).
- Johnson, M. (1987), The Body in the Mind (Chicago).
- Kövecses, Z. (2000), Metaphor and Emotion: Language, Culture, and Body in Human Feeling (Cambridge).
- (2008), 'Metaphor and Emotion', in Gibbs (2008), 380-96.
- Lakoff, G. (1987), Women, Fire, and Dangerous Things: What Categories Reveal about the Mind (Chicago).
- Lakoff, G. and Johnson, M. (1980), Metaphors We Live By (Chicago).
- Munteanu, D. L. (2012), Tragic Pathos: Pity and Fear in Greek Philosophy and Tragedy (Cambridge).
- Oatley, K. (2011), Such Stuff as Dreams: The Psychology of Fiction (Oxford/Malden MA).
- Williams, L. E. and Bargh, J. A. (2008), 'Experiencing Physical Warmth Promotes Interpersonal Warmth', *Science* 322. 5901, 606-7.
- Zhong, C.-B. and Leonardelli, G. J. (2008), 'Cold and Lonely: Does Social Exclusion Literally Feel Cold?' *Psychological Science* 19.9, 838-42.